

Delhi City Development Plan: Who has seen it?

Centre for Civil Society
16 March 2007

Government rules out involvement of citizens in the creation of Delhi City Development Plan under the Jawaharlal Nehru National Urban Renewal Mission

What is the Jawaharlal Nehru National Urban Renewal Mission (JNNURM)?

JNNURM is an initiative of the Central Government in which it will fund 63 cities towards urban development. In return, the cities will have to carry out urban reforms at the state and local level. The Mission is for a seven year period starting from the year 2005-2006. The total allocation for the mission is Rs. 50,000 Crore to be spent in seven years by the Central Government and an equal amount will be spent in this period by the State Governments and the Urban Local Bodies.

Cities applying for funds need to submit the following to the Central Government:

1. City Development Plan
2. Detail Project Report
3. Memorandum of Agreement

What is the City Development Plan? How is it to be made?

Toolkit II of JNNURM describes the role of the City Development Plan (CDP):

(i) *In-depth analysis of the existing situation, covering the demographic, economic, financial, infrastructure, physical, environmental and institutional aspects:* The purpose of this stage is to review and analyse the current status of the city with regard to the state of its development, systems and procedures, as equally its institutional and financial context. This stage is meant to identify the strengths and weaknesses in the city's development and to provide an understanding of what impedes service delivery and management within the existing set-up and what contributes to better service provision. This stage offers an opportunity to bring out the unique features of the city that may distinguish it from other cities.

(ii) *Development of a perspective and a vision of the city:* Using the results of the first stage of analysis combined with consultations with key stakeholders and civil society, this stage is meant to develop a vision for the future development – a **shared vision** of where the city wants to be in a medium-term perspective. It is a **collective vision of the future** direction expressed in terms of expectations and often even goals, such as “water for all”.

(iii) *Formulating a strategy for bridging the gap between where the city is and where it wishes to go:* It is in this stage that strategies and interventions are identified for attaining the vision and future development perspectives. This stage is used to first identify the options and strategies and second, to evaluate the strategies from the perspective of their contribution to the goals and objectives of the JNNURM.

The chosen strategies are translated into programmes and projects in this stage. This is the phase where the city needs to decide which programmes would contribute most to the vision and medium-term perspectives. It is at this stage where criteria are selected, with appropriate consultative processes, for prioritising the strategies, programmes and projects.

(iv) **Preparing a City Investment Plan (CIP) and a financing strategy:** An investment plan and a financing strategy are an integral part of the CDP. It is an aggregate investment plan indicating, for instance, the cost involved in providing 24/7 water supply from the present level of 10/7; it is not a financial estimate of a project for increasing the capacity of a water plant from 1,00,000 mld to 1,50,000 mld. Crucial to this stage is a plan that considers the alternative sources of financing the vision and the accompanying strategy and programmes.

The guidelines mandate that:

- ❖ Key stakeholders and civil society organisations should be consulted in making the CDP
- ❖ The CDP should reflect the **shared and collective** vision of the citizens of the city

How was the Delhi CDP prepared?

The Delhi CDP was prepared by IL & FS Ecosmart for a fee of Rs. 18 lacs. As per information obtained by CCS through an RTI application, before the CDP was drafted, the Delhi Government had only one consultation with civil society organisations on their views of the city. IL & FS Ecosmart made the CDP and submitted it to the government. Without showing the CDP to any citizen or civil society organisation, the Delhi Government submitted it to the Centre for approval. It is also puzzling that the CDP was commissioned by the Govt. of NCT of Delhi and that there is no involvement of the main urban local body (ULB) for Delhi, namely, the MCD, in the consultations and/or preparation of the CDP. According to the vision of JNNURM, it is the ULB representing the people of the city that is supposed to prepare the CDP. What is worse, the Delhi government has refused to make the CDP public (the RTI response to this effect is attached).

The CDP claims that a total of 66 people represented the 14 million people of Delhi urban area as primary stakeholders! **On all, that is, one person for about 2 lakh Delhiites!**

This raises the following questions:

1. How were 66 people sufficient to represent all the primary stakeholders in Delhi?
2. Why weren't the above consultations repeated *after* the CDP was made?
3. Why does the RTI response not mention any consultation other than the two stakeholder's workshops?

How has the CDP been prepared in other cities under JNNURM?

1. In Vadodara, consultations were held with six groups consisting of a total sample of 5000 residents covering different sections of society (NGOs, industrialists, builders, urban poor etc). The CDP has also taken on board the responses from a study done by an NGO (SEWA), which reflects the opinions of the urban poor with respect to the priorities, outlined in the vision. The stakeholder consultation for Vadodara also has a fairly equitable spatial spread - 1825 samples collected from all wards & zones of Vadodara. Vadodara has also been innovative – a weeklong “Vadodara festival’ was organised which included an essay competition for students titled ‘My Dream city Vadodara’.
2. In Hyderabad, a CDS was already in place before the CDP. During the course of preparation of the CDS, between September 2001 and December 2003, six meetings were held with the stakeholders phased out evenly throughout this period. Against this backdrop, the CDP was also shared with the stakeholders after a draft CDP was in place.
3. In Surat, stakeholders included officials, commercial organizations, technocrats, eminent citizens, councilors and NGOs. SMC distributed 30,000 copies of questionnaire to identified stakeholders. About 13% filled questionnaires were received and analyzed.
4. In Vijayawada, 10 working groups formed for consultations. A separate consultative process was adopted for periphery municipalities.

Source: Dey, Paramita and Shreekant Gupta. *Community-oriented City Development Plans*. NIUA Working Paper 06-02. November 2006

CORRECTIVE ACTION URGENTLY NECESSARY

- | |
|--|
| <ol style="list-style-type: none">1. To bring back the CDP and put it in the public domain for discussion and debate2. Incorporate suggestions and feedback from the people3. Send the revised CDP to the Government of India for approval |
|--|

For more information and your feedback, please contact:

Makarand Bakore

Centre for Civil Society, 9312444725, 23537456/26521882, makarand@ccs.in